

**GENESEE TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL
QUARTERLY BOARD MEETING
Penfield Town Hall
3100 Atlantic Avenue
Penfield, NY**

June 9, 2016

GTC BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Eric Gott, Livingston County (Vice Chairperson)
Daniel Hogan, Monroe County – At-large
Steven LeRoy, Wayne County
John F. Marren, Ontario County and Genesee/Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council (Chairperson)

ALTERNATE REPRESENTATIVES PRESENT

Kevin Bush, New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), representing Mathew Driscoll
Bill Carpenter, Rochester Genesee Regional Transportation Authority (RGRTA), representing James Redmond
Jerry Davis, Wyoming County, representing A. Douglas Berwanger
Tom Goodwin, Monroe County Planning Board
Andrea Guzzetta, Rochester City Council, representing Loretta Scott
Thomas Hurley, NYS Thruway Authority (NYSTA), representing Maria Lehman
Norman Jones, City of Rochester, representing Lovely Warren
Zina Lagonegro, Rochester City Planning Commission, representing David L. Watson
Scott Leathersich, Monroe County – At-Large
Charles Nesbitt, Jr., Orleans County, representing David B. Callard
Edward G. Muszynski, Empire State Development Corporation, representing Howard Zemsky
Terrence Rice, Monroe County, representing Cheryl Dinolfo

GTC BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT AND UNREPRESENTED

Allen G. Casey, Rochester – At-Large
Raymond Cianfrini, Genesee County
Anthony Daniele, Monroe County
Dr. Timothy Dennis, Yates County
Peter Osborn, Federal Highway Administration (FHWA)
John Moffitt, Monroe County Supervisors' Association
Basil Seggos, New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
Henrika Buchanan-Smith, Federal Transit Administration (FTA)
Steven Urlass, Federal Aviation Administration
Gary Westfall, Seneca County

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE

Jody Binnix, GTC staff	Ken Miller, Wayne County
Todd Campbell, Town of W. Bloomfield	Christopher Reeve, NYSDOT-Region 4
Peter Ingalsbe, Town of Farmington	Jim Stack, GTC staff
Angela Ellis, Livingston County	James Willer, NYSDOT-Region 4
Don Higgins, Livingston County	Chris Tortora, GTC staff
Joel Kleinberg, NYSDOT-Region 4	David Zorn, G/FLRPC
William W. Napier, Monroe County	

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Chairman Marren called the meeting to order at 8:34 a.m.

Jody Binnix, GTC staff, called the roll; a quorum was present.

2. Public Forum

No one from the public spoke during the Public Forum.

3. Approval of Minutes

Bill Carpenter moved to approve the minutes from the March 10, 2016 Quarterly Meeting as presented; Terry Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unopposed.

4. Communications and Announcements

Jim Stack provided the following communications and announcements:

- The Orleans County Legislature has appointed Charles Nesbitt, Jr. as the GTC Alternate for Chairman David Callard

5. Reports and Action on Old Business

a. Planning Committee Report – Scott Leathersich, Chairman

Scott Leathersich provided the following report:

The Planning Committee met April 7th and May 12th, and recommends that the GTC Board:

- Amend the *FY 2016-2017 Unified Planning Work Program* to reflect the contribution of actual FY 2015-2016 rollover amounts;
- Accept reports as evidence of completion of two Unified Planning Work Program tasks;
- Amend the *2014-2017 Transportation Improvement Program* as requested by NYSDOT and the City of Rochester;
- Adopt the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region 2040*;
- Certify that all Federal planning requirements are met; and
- Adopt the *2017-2020 Transportation Improvement Program*.

Additionally, the Planning Committee took the following action:

- Approved the *DRAFT 2017-2020 Transportation Improvement Program Update Project List* for Public Review;

- Endorsed the Transportation Investments Generating Economic Recovery or TIGER Program grant requests from the Rochester Genesee Regional Transportation Authority and Livingston County;
- Approved the project Scopes of Work of four new *FY 2016-2017 Unified Planning Work Program* tasks; and
- Approved three administrative modifications to the *2014-2017 Transportation Improvement Program* as requested by Ontario County as well as the New York State Department of Transportation on behalf of both the City and the Town of Batavia.

b. GTC Staff Report – Jim Stack, Executive Director

Jim Stack provided the following report:

With respect to the Long Range Transportation Plan, GTC's plan to guide policy and investment decisions for the next twenty five years, the draft has been finalized and will be discussed under agenda item 6.f.

With respect to the Transportation Improvement Program or TIP, GTC's four-year capital program, the draft has been finalized and will be discussed under agenda item 6.f.

c. Old Business

1. Federal Legislative and Funding Update

Jim Stack provided the following report:

The Final Rule for Statewide and Non-Metropolitan, as well as Metropolitan Planning and Programming was published on May 27. The Final Rule takes effect 30 days later and has a two-year phase in for ensuring new Transportation Improvement Programs and Long Range Plans are compliant with this rule, which is the next cycle for us. GTC staff will be participating in various webinars and other information exchanges to better understand the full implications of the Final Rule.

Through participation in the statewide Association of MPOs, we already have highlights of a few key changes. Two new Planning Factors have to be incorporated into future Long Range Plans: the first is improve the resiliency and reliability of the transportation system and reduce or mitigate stormwater impacts of surface transportation. The second is enhance travel and tourism.

We feel we are well prepared to fully incorporate these factors into the next Long Range Plan and have already started addressing them to some extent.

The Final Rule also establishes requirements for implementation of performance-based planning. Again, we feel we are well positioned for this since we started

identifying performance measures in the Long Range Plan adopted five years ago. States are required to set performance targets followed by individual MPO targets. It is expected that there will be a high level of coordination between New York State and the MPOs on the establishment of performance targets.

Many of the requirements of the new Planning Rule mirror existing requirements or are already a part of how GTC operates.

As noted a few minutes ago, the Planning Committee endorsed the projects RGRTA and Livingston County submitted for the FFY 2016 Transportation Investments Generating Economic Recovery, or TIGER, program of the U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT). RGRTA submitted one of the 337 applications from urban areas and Livingston County submitted one of the 248 applications from rural areas. In total, \$9.3 billion was requested versus a total \$500 million available. We hope to know this fall if either project gets the needed funding.

The Fixing America's Surface Transportation or FAST Act established the Fostering Advancements in Shipping and Transportation for the Long-term Achievement of National Efficiencies or FASTLANE grant program. NYSDOT submitted an application for the I-490 @ I-390 Interchange improvement project. This was one of 136 projects in urban areas and 76 in rural areas. In total nearly \$9.8 billion was requested versus a total of \$800 million available. We hope to know this fall if this project gets the needed funding.

When you look at the level of interest in discretionary programs like TIGER and FASTLANE, it is obvious that there is a great need for investment in our transportation infrastructure. Given the inadequate levels of formula funding, the region has lost its ability to pursue transformational projects. In fact, we are struggling just to maintain what we have. At some point the general public and elected leaders are going to have to come to agreement on the level of investment necessary, and the funding to pay it, for our country to stay atop the world in the quality and functionality of our infrastructure, with transportation being the primary focus of this council.

On May 19, the US Senate passed the FY2017 Transportation, Housing and Urban Development, and Related Agencies, or T-HUD Appropriations Act. The bill prioritizes funding for transportation projects and programs to encourage economic growth. It provides \$16.9 billion in discretionary appropriations for USDOT, \$1.7 billion below the FY2016 enacted level and \$2.5 billion below the President's request. Within this amount, funding is also prioritized on programs to make transportation systems safe, efficient, and reliable. The bill would also rescind \$2.211 billion for the coming year from state DOTs' unobligated highway contract authority, and require that the cuts be applied in some federal highway programs that are most widely used by the states.

For Highways, the bill provides \$44 billion from the Highway Trust Fund to be spent on the Federal-aid Highways Program, consistent with the FAST Act. The

bill continues to allow state departments of transportation to repurpose old, unused earmarks for more important infrastructure projects.

For Transit, the bill provides \$12.3 billion for the FTA, \$575 million above FY2016 enacted level. The bill provides \$9.7 billion for transit formula grants, consistent with the FAST Act.

On May 24, the House Appropriations Committee approved the FY2017 T-HUD, funding bill for the budget year beginning October 1. The bill provides \$44 billion for highway programs in the Highway Trust Fund as authorized by the FAST Act. The bill provides \$12.5 billion in funds for transit, including \$9.7 billion in formula grants to transit agencies, again as authorized by the FAST Act.

The House bill does not contain the rescission called for in the Senate bill. This and other differences will need to be worked out via a Conference Committee.

7. Action Items

- a. Amending the *FY 2016-2017 UPWP to reflect the contribution of actual FY 2015-16 rollover amounts* / Proposed Resolution 16-43

Scott Leathersich moved to approve proposed Resolution 16-43; Kevin Bush seconded the motion.

Jim Stack noted that proposed Resolution 16-43 was reviewed and recommended for approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

The Unified Planning Work Program, or UPWP, is the annual work program for GTC staff and supports transportation planning for local communities. This Board adopted the 2016-17 UPWP at its March 10, 2016 meeting. The UPWP was developed with estimated rollover amounts based on activity through the third quarter in the last fiscal year for projects that were not expected to be completed by March 31. Now that the accounting for FY 2015-16 has been closed out, the budgets for these projects can be adjusted to reflect fourth quarter activity. This is a routine adjustment that is made every June. Exhibit 1 on page 47, of the full meeting package, demonstrates a significant level of progress in the fourth quarter. The one exception is Task 1600 under GTC, which is a reflection of savings from the staff core budget. These savings will be available for future projects.

The motion passed unopposed.

- b. Accepting reports as evidence of completion of various UPWP Tasks

Chairman Marren suggested grouping proposed Resolutions 16-42 and 16-44 into a single action; no Member or Alternate objected.

Bill Carpenter moved to approve proposed Resolutions 16-42 and 16-44; Charles Nesbitt seconded the motion.

Jim Stack noted that proposed Resolution 16-42 was reviewed and recommended for Board approval by the Planning Committee at its April 7, 2016 meeting, and Proposed Resolution 16-44 was reviewed and recommended for Board approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

Jim provided the following overview:

- (1) Accepting the *Regional Transportation and Food Systems Analysis* as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 5242 / Proposed Resolution 16-42

The Genesee Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council conducted this study to seek to promote local and regional food systems by conducting a baseline assessment of land use and transportation barriers and developing recommendations for actions. The project identified and interviewed a diverse sampling of stakeholders involved in food production, processing, wholesale, retail, and waste management activities throughout the region. The project provides solutions to the transportation issues identified, such as case studies and other policies, plans, and tools in land use, transportation, and economic development.

- (2) Accepting the *Genesee-Finger Lakes Regional Critical Transportation Infrastructure Vulnerability Assessment* as evidence of completion of UPWP Task 5750 / Proposed Resolution 16-44

Jim apologized for the copying error that only provided odd numbered pages of the Executive Summary in the meeting package. Board members should have received replacement pages earlier this week.

GTC staff conducted this study to evaluate vulnerable transportation infrastructure and identify strategies to mitigate hazard impacts, whether natural or man-made. The study focused on infrastructure and facilities. Each asset was assessed for vulnerability based on criticality, sensitivity, exposure, and local input. The study then focused on asset in the High or Moderately High vulnerability categories. A hazard mitigation strategy toolbox was developed to provide GTC and member agencies as well as other municipalities with a toolbox for minimizing or eliminating the potential impacts of natural or human-caused hazard events on critical transportation assets. Lastly, the study identified potential funding sources to implement mitigation strategies.

The motion passed unopposed.

- c. Amending the *2014-2017 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP)*

Chairman Marren suggested grouping proposed Resolutions 16-45, 16-46, and 16-50 into a single action. Bill Carpenter requested that separate action be taken on Resolution 16-50.

Terry Rice moved to approve proposed Resolutions 16-45 and 16-46; Kevin Bush seconded the motion.

Jim stated that proposed Resolutions 16-45 and 16-46 were reviewed and recommended for Board approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

Jim noted that the TIP is required to be fiscally constrained which means we cannot program more federal funds than we have available for any given source in any given year.

- (1) Amending the *2014-2017 TIP* by decreasing the cost of the Ames St., Buffalo Rd., Main St., and West Ave. Preventive Maint. project / Proposed Resolution 16-45

This amendment is requested by NYSDOT on behalf of the City of Rochester. The cost reduction reflects the final estimate before going to bid. The reason for reducing the cost within the TIP is to avoid tying up funds that may be able to support other projects.

- (2) Amending the *2014-2017 TIP* by increasing the cost of the STP-Urban Block Program project / Proposed Resolution 16-46

This amendment is requested by NYSDOT. The purpose of this amendment is to put the funds reduced in the last item into a funding block so they are accounted for and available to support other projects.

Terry Rice asked Norman Jones what the bids were for the asphalt regarding Proposed Resolution 16-45. Norman replied that the bids came in lower than the estimate and the City has enough funding to complete the project as amended.

The motion passed unopposed.

Chairman Marren requested a motion to discuss proposed Resolutions 16-50.

Bill Carpenter moved to approve proposed Resolution 16-50; Eric Gott seconded the motion.

Jim Stack stated that proposed Resolutions 16-50 was reviewed and recommended for Board approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

- (3) Amending the *2014-2017 TIP* by increasing the total cost of the Main St. Streetscape & Pedestrian Wayfinding Enhancement Project / Proposed Resolution 16-50

This amendment is requested by the City of Rochester at the behest of NYSDOT. This project contains a significant share of extra work being paid for by the City of Rochester and being constructed in conjunction with the federal-aid project, this extra work is known as a betterment. In an effort to reflect the full cost of the project, NYSDOT Main Office and the Federal Highway Administration want

to have the value of betterments shown on the TIP. This action adds local funds but does not change the federal amount.

Bill Carpenter stated at the time of the May 12 Planning Committee Meeting RGRTA had concerns regarding design elements of the City's project. Subsequent to the Planning Committee both parties met in person. The City and RGRTA worked together to successfully come to an agreement on the design for bike lanes in the vicinity of the Downtown Transit Center.

The motion passed unopposed.

- d. Adopting the *Long Range Transportation Plan for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region 2040* / Proposed Resolution 16-47

Chairman Marren stated that the Board must take action on the LRTP in June. At this meeting Jim will present a brief overview of the LRTP with plans for a formal presentation in September.

Daniel Hogan moved to approve proposed Resolutions 16-47; Kevin Bush seconded the motion.

Jim Stack apologized for the omission of the proposed resolution from the meeting package. Board members should have received it earlier this week.

Proposed Resolution 16-47 was reviewed and recommended for Board approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

Jim explained that LRTP provides a strategic framework for policy, planning, and investment decision making to ensure that the multiple agencies that own, maintain, and operate transportation infrastructure and services are working towards the "3C" process continuously, cooperatively, and comprehensively in a coordinated fashion. Above all else we want LRTP 2040 to be approachable and readable to all the region's residents, businesses, and government agencies no matter one's level of transportation expertise. We think we have accomplished this.

Although the LRTP is only required for the Rochester Metropolitan Planning Area, which is all of Monroe County plus the adjacent developed areas of Livingston, Ontario, and Wayne counties, GTC continues to plan for the entire nine-county region. This recognizes the fact that transportation concerns do not stop at a boundary on a map.

The GTC Planning Committee approved a public review document at its February 11 meeting. That document was made available for public review from February 16 through March 18. GTC staff held meetings in Batavia (Genesee County), Hopewell (Ontario County), and Rochester.

We received a significant number of comments that have been summarized for the final LRTP. The comments were beneficial and caused us to clarify some of the recommendations and add two recommendations to the final draft.

The LRTP contains 7 Goals and 21 Objectives that are consistent with those established in the Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century, or MAP-21, and continued in the Fixing America's Surface Transportation, or FAST Act. The LRTP also has four guiding principles:

- Plan for People; people are the customers, not transportation infrastructure.
- Place Matters; where people live, work, and play will determine the appropriate solutions to their transportation needs.
- Transition to Tomorrow; adequate transportation funding for the foreseeable future is significantly less than the amount required to maintain a state of good repair.
- Accept Uncertainty; Even though the FAST Act provides certainty over the next five years, how transportation investments will be funded over the long-term remains uncertain.

Development of the LRTP 2040 had more public engagement than ever before. We made a concerted effort to go where the people are and utilized online tools to gain their input early in the process. We did so again when it was time to get feedback on the recommendations.

An additional recommendation was added to the LRTP in direct response to a public comment. With this addition, the LRTP has 64 recommendations covering a broad range of transportation modes, needs, and opportunities. There are also five Illustrative Projects for which the region does not have the financial resources to implement. I am confident that if additional funding is brought to the region for any of these projects, GTC will take the necessary steps to ensure that funding can be used for implementation.

This product is the result of about two years of work by GTC staff. It is a Plan that the region can be proud of. GTC staff will continue to conduct QA/QC to look for editorial changes that do not affect the intent of the draft document before publishing.

The motion passed unopposed.

- e. Certifying that all Federal planning requirements are met / Proposed Resolution 16-48

Scott Leathersich moved to approve proposed Resolutions 16-48; Bill Carpenter seconded the motion.

Jim Stack apologized for the omission of the proposed resolution from the meeting package. Board members should have received it earlier this week.

Proposed Resolution 16-48 was reviewed and recommended for your approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

Jim explained that every four years, the FHWA and the FTA perform a comprehensive certification review of the transportation planning processes conducted by GTC in its role as the designated Metropolitan Planning Organization for the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region. The last FHWA/FTA certification of GTC was made in February 2014.

In the intervening years, concurrent with the submittal of the entire proposed Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) to the FHWA and the FTA as part of the Statewide TIP approval, GTC is required to "self-certify" that its policy, planning, and programming processes are consistent with applicable federal and state laws as well as regional and local priorities. This certification takes the form of a Self-Certification Document, the content of which is specified by NYSDOT.

GTC staff have compiled the Self-Certification Document to give a comprehensive overview of the GTC planning process.

The motion passed unopposed.

- f. Adopting the *FFY 2017-2020 Transportation Improvement Program* / Proposed Resolution 16-49

Terry Rice moved to approve proposed Resolutions 16-49; Daniel Hogan seconded the motion.

Jim Stack stated that Proposed Resolution 16-49 was reviewed and recommended for Board approval by the Planning Committee at its May 12, 2016 meeting.

The GTC Planning Committee approved a public review document at its April 7 meeting. That document was made available for public review from April 11 through May 10. GTC staff held public meetings in Ogden, Henrietta, Fairport, and Rochester. Unfortunately, no one from the general public attended any of the meetings.

Jim expressed appreciation for the work of the TIP Development Committee (TDC). They are partners in the process and truly have the interest of the region in mind when selecting projects.

He noted that the regional TIP will be combined with other regional TIPs from across New York to establish a Statewide TIP, or STIP, for consideration and approval by the Federal Highway Administration and the Federal Transit Administration. The new TIP and STIP will go into effect on October 1 to coincide with the Federal Fiscal Year.

Jim delivered a presentation on the *FFY 2017-2020 Transportation Improvement Program*.

Edward Muszynski complimented the presentation.

Terry Rice stated that this TIP cycle was the hardest yet. Terry thanked the TDC for their hard work and dedication, noting that it was especially hard for the highway superintendents to choose which project received funding when there was such great needs.

Terry added that New York State had traditionally held back 10 percent of the funding, however this time they kept 30 percent of the funding. Terry is hopeful that the region will receive additional money through the state to take care of unfunded needs such as 390/490/Lyell Avenue Interchange.

Additionally, NYSDOT Region-4 was forced to use federal funds to pay for striping, which was a first in the TIP process, while the local municipalities have to use their own resources.

Norman Jones asked, in light of the fact that GTC held four TIP public meetings with zero attendance, what else GTC and the Board can collectively do to spur attendance at the public meetings and bring the public into the process.

Jim Stack replied that it may be a phenomenon of people just being busy and not appreciating or understanding the TIP. GTC is working with Tom Brede of RTS to develop new strategies to help with publicizing public input opportunities. Jim further stated that a local community group did provide comments regarding the Lake Ontario State Parkway and spoke at the public forum during the May Planning Committee meeting.

Daniel Hogan noted that GTC and UNICON could work together on a campaign to bring awareness to the lack of transportation funding. Jim agreed noting that options could be discussed at an upcoming UNICON meeting on July 7 at which he will be making a presentation on the TIP.

Kevin Bush reiterated Terry's previous comments regarding the hold back of funding by the state. Kevin also explained that the regional allocation is determined by a needs-based formula. Overall region has done a better job, compared to other regions in the state, at maintaining our system. This means our region tends to get less money. Kevin is also hopeful this system will change. Jim agreed with Kevin and noted GTC has continued to raise concerns to NYSDOT-Main Office about how the needs models affect the distribution of funds.

Kevin further stated that the Governor has announced funding for the 390/490/Lyell Avenue Interchange although details remain unclear.

Chairman Marren thanked the TDC for their efforts and Terry for his remarks about the process. He stated that involving the public is tough unless the issue is directly impacting them. He supported a partnership with UNICON to help spread the

message surrounding the lack of funding and complimented NYSDOT Region-4 for always being a team player.

The motion passed unopposed.

8. New Business

Jim Stack recognized the efforts of Jody Binnix on both the UPWP adopted in March and the Long Range Plan adopted today. She has been instrumental in completing both of these required products. In particular, her efforts on coordinating the Long Range Plan and performing all the layout work have resulted in a Plan that is readable and very attractive, which is not easy to do. In recognition of her hard work, Jody has been promoted to Program Manager for Long Range Planning & Performance Measurement effective Monday, June 13.

9. Next Meeting

Chairman Marren stated that the next GTC Board meeting is scheduled for September 1, 2016 at the Penfield Town Hall, 3100 Atlantic Avenue in Penfield.

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9:59 a.m.